

500-10-006048-159

# Court of appeal of Quebec

Montreal

---

Appeal from a judgment of the Superior Court, District of Laval, rendered on December 4, 2015 by the Honourable Michael Stober

---

N°: (540-01-063428-141)

HER MAJESTY THE QUEEN

**APPELLANT** - prosecutrix

v.

VITTORIO MIRARCHI  
CALOGERO MILIOTO  
STEVEN FRACAS  
FELICE RACANIELLO  
JACK SIMPSON  
PIETRO MAGISTRALE  
STEVEN D'ADDARIO

**RESPONDENTS** - accused

---

**APPELLANT'S FACTUM  
INCLUDES SCHEDULE I AND SCHEDULE II**

---

**Me Robert Rouleau**  
**Me Marie-Christine Godbout**  
Bureau de la grande criminalité et des  
affaires spéciales  
393, rue St-Jacques, Bureau 600  
Montréal (Québec) H2Y 1B9  
Telephone number: 514-873-3922  
Fax number: 514-864-0847  
[robert.rouleau@dpcp.gouv.qc.ca](mailto:robert.rouleau@dpcp.gouv.qc.ca)  
[marie-christine.godbout@dpcp.gouv.qc.ca](mailto:marie-christine.godbout@dpcp.gouv.qc.ca)

**Appellant**

**Me Alexis Gauthier**  
Complexe Guy-Favreau, Tour est  
200, boul. René-Lévesque ouest,  
9<sup>ième</sup> étage  
Montréal (Québec) H2Z 1X4  
Telephone number: 514 283-3826  
Fax number: 514 496-7372  
[alexis.gauthier@ppsc-sppc.gc.ca](mailto:alexis.gauthier@ppsc-sppc.gc.ca)

**Appellant**

500-10-006048-159

# Court of appeal of Quebec

Montreal

---

Appeal from a judgment of the Superior Court, District of Laval, rendered on December 4, 2015 by the Honourable Michael Stober

---

N°: (540-01-063428-141)

**Me Frank Addario and Me William Thompson**

Addario Law Group  
171 John Street  
Suite 101  
Toronto (Ontario) M5T 1X3  
Telephone: (416) 649-5055  
Fax: (866) 714-1196

**Me Michael W. Lacy and Me Maxime Hébrard**

Brauti Thorning Zibarras LLP  
151 Yonge Street , Suite 1800  
Toronto, (Ontario) M5C 2W7  
Telephone : (416) 360-2776 x5546  
Telephone 514-868-9090  
Fax : (416) 362-8410

**Me Dominique Shoofey**

338, rue Saint-Antoine, bureau 300  
Montréal (Québec) H2Y 1A3  
Telephone: (514) 523-7676  
Fax: (514) 866-2929

**Me Bruce Engel**

116 Lisgar Street, Suite 210  
Ottawa (Ontario) K2P 0C2  
Telephone: (613) 235-6324  
Fax : (613) 235-3159

**Me Jeffrey K. Boro**

**Me Robert Polnicky**

**Me Annie Émond**

Boro, Polnicky, Lighter  
500, place D'Armes, # 2350  
Montréal (Québec) H2Y 2W2  
Telephone: (514) 288-0444  
Fax: (514) 288-7772

**Me Giuseppe Battista, Ad. E.**

**et Me Mathieu Corbo**

Shadley, Battista, Costom, s.e.n.c.  
1100, av. des Canadiens-de-Montréal Ouest  
10<sup>e</sup> étage, boîtes 17  
Montréal (Québec) H3B 2S2  
Telephone: (514) 866-4043 poste 208  
Fax: (514) 866-8719

**Me Ronnie MacDonald**

Raby, Dubé, Leborgne, Rougeau  
404, rue Saint-Dizier, Bureau A-06  
Montréal (Québec) H2Y 3T3  
Telephone: (514) 840-9119, poste 206  
Fax : (514) 840-0177

**Me François Dadour**

Poupart, Dadour, Touma et Associés  
507 place D'Armes, Bureau 1700  
Montréal (Québec) H2Y 2W8  
Telephone: (514) 526-0861  
Télécopieur: (514-526-9646

**Me Anil Kapoor**

Kapoor Barristers  
235 King Street East, 2nd Floor  
Toronto (Ontario) M5A 1J9  
Telephone: (416) 363-2700  
Fax: (416) 363-2787

TABLE OF CONTENTS

VOLUME PAGE

APPELLANT'S FACTUM

VOLUME I

PART I           FACTS ..... | ..... 1

PART II           ISSUES IN DISPUTE..... | ..... 6

PART III          ARGUMENTS ..... | ..... 7

          a.    The finding of privilege and its corollary: the nature of the  
              balancing exercise ..... | ..... 8

          b.    The balancing exercise itself: relative use of the information  
              and nature of the charges ..... | ..... 19

PART IV          CONCLUSIONS..... | ..... 29

PART V          AUTHORITIES ..... | ..... 30

SCHEDULE I – JUDGMENT APPEALED FROM

R. v. Mirarchi & al, December 4, 2015, Michael Stober, J.S.C.,  
540-01-063428-141 (S.37 objection) ..... | ..... 31

R. v. Mirarchi & al, November 18, 2015, Michael Stober, J.S.C.  
540-01-063428-141 (Common Law Judgement) ..... | ..... 54

SCHEDULE II – PROCEEDING AND REGULATORY

PROCEEDINGS

Appeal from an order of disclosure rendered by a Superior Court under s.  
37 of the Canada Evidence Act and Notice of appeal..... | ..... 149

Direct Indictment..... | ..... 159

REGULATORY AND/OR LEGISLATIVE PROVISIONS

Sections 37 to 37.3 Canada Evidence Act..... | ..... 160

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	VOLUME	PAGE
<b>VOLUME II</b>		
<u>SCHEDULE III</u>		
<u>EXHIBITS</u>		
R-25: Motion "Investigative privilege" (en liasse).....	II	165
R-25 C 1: Respondent's Reply to the application for disclosure of information and annexes .....	II	203
R-25 C 2 I: Document that identifies the individuals involved in the conversation.....	II	240
R-25,1: Agreement to a procedure for inspector Mark Flynn's ex parte testimony ....	II	248
R-25,2: Joseph S. Wilkinson's affidavit (Motion for Special I Disclosure).....	II	251
R-25.3: Lettre datée du 25 août 2011 (RCMP).....	II	257
R-25.4: Lettre datée du 12 septembre 2011 (RCMP).....	II	258
R-25.5: Lettre datée du 14 septembre 2011 (RCMP).....	II	259
R-25.6: Affidavit of Jason Morton dated the 16th June 2011.....	II	260
R-25,7: Pin to pin printout sent out Friday 26 August 2011 at 17:21 .....	II	271
R-25,8: Pin to pin HTML printout sent out Thursday 14 July 2011 at 10:29 .....	II	273
R-25,9: Communication security Establishment, Security of Blackberry Pin to Pin messaging, Document originally signed Toni Moffa Deputy chief IT security .....	II	280
R-25,10: Lettre de 2 pages de Me Lacy Michael datée le 18 novembre 2014 .....	II	283

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	VOLUME	PAGE
R-25,11		
Unredacted sealed transcript Mark Flynn ..... <i>(Not reproduced in Appellant's factum)</i>		
R-25,12:		
First redacted copy of Inspector Flynn's ex parte testimony ..... II		285
R-25,12A:		
One page investigative Techniques motion (R-25) Redacted ex parte testimony of inspector Mark Flynn ..... II		312
R-25,12B:		
Two page document entitled "Accused"s reponse to proposed judicial summary of redacted testimony" ..... II		313
R-25,13:		
Document de 27 pages updated redacted version of Inspector Flynn ex parte testimony - includes numbered questions ..... II		315
R-25,13A:		
3 pages Recto-verso Judicial summary ..... II		342
R-25,14:		
Décision du juge Hélène Morin, JQC, #500-54-000074-105, 9 pages recto-verso "Authorization to intercept private communications" ..... II		344
R-25,15:		
Document intitulé "Motion R-25: Investigative Techniques Privilege proposal order for the transmission of audio recordings and unredacted transcripts of ex parte hearings of the amicus curiae" ..... II		349
R-25,16:		
Agreed statment of facts on the chronology of disclosure for the purpose of motion R-25 ..... II		350
R-25,17:		
Affidavit de Patrick Boismenu daté le 25 novembre 2015, "Expertise Report, Projet Clemenza" and Curriculum vitae ..... II		354
R-25,18:		
Affidavit de "Alan William Treddenick" 25 novembre 2015 ..... II		376
R-25,19 I:		
Judgement rendered orally upon motions for disclosure of information upon which Crown is claiming investigative Techniques privilege <i>(Not reproduced in Appellant's factum official copy filed as "Common Law judgement)</i>		
R-25,20:		
Parties joint position on relevance of S.37 CEA's new evidence ..... II		378

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	VOLUME	PAGE
<b><u>R-32 (En liasse) Applicant's factum and application record in relation to MDI</u></b>		
R v Mirarchi - Applicant's Factum. ....	II	379
R. v. Mirarchi et al. - Notice of Application for Disclosure of Information to Obtain a General Warrant, dated December 17, 2010 .....	II	399
Technical Report #2 authored by Sgt. Martin Dubois, undated .....	II	495
Affidavit of Megan Savard .....	II	524
	II	563

<b>VOLUME III</b>
-------------------

Ex A - 28HarvJLTech1 .....	III	571
Ex C - A Lot More than a Pen Register .....	III	647
Ex E1 - Meet the machines that steal your phone's data _ Ars Technica .....	III	685
Ex E2 - Meet the machines that steal your phone's data 2_ Ars Technica .....	III	689
Ex F - Hacker Spoofs Cell Phone Tower to Intercept Calls _ WIRED .....	III	693
Ex G - We Must Secure America's Cell Networks From Criminals and Cops _ WIRED .....	III	698
Ex H - FBI's 'Stingray' Cellphone Tracker Stirs a Fight Over Search Warrants, Fourth Amendment - WSJ .....	III	703
Ex I - How a Stingray Works - Washington Post .....	III	709
Ex J - The covert cellphone tracking tech the RCMP and CSIS wont talk about - The Globe and Mail .....	III	710
Ex K - Met police using surveillance system to monitor mobile phones _ UK news _ The Guardian .....	III	714
Ex L - imsi_catcher_update .....	III	718
Ex M - Florida v Thomas - transcript .....	III	740
Ex N - 1440-S.SL - Washington State Law .....	III	867
Ex P - KingFish Product Description .....	III	876
Ex P - StingRay Product Description .....	III	878

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	VOLUME	PAGE
Ex Q - 3G UMTS IMSI Catcher _ PKI Electronic Intelligence GmbH Germany .....	III	880
Ex Q - GSM IMSI Catcher _ PKI Electronic Intelligence GmbH Germany.....	III	881
R. v. Desjardins et al - Crown's reply to motions R-32 and 32A on the MDI technique.....	III	882
R33 (en liasse) : Motions R25, R32 and R32A Order for appointment of an amicus curiae .....	III	898
R-32.1: Courriel daté le 2 septembre 2011 de Russell Moore à Michel Messier .....	III	901
R-32.2: Courriel du 3 décembre 2012 de Rick Gendre à Michel Messier .....	III	902
R32.3: Rapport complémentaire sur l'utilisation de l'appareil IDM .....	III	903
R-32.4: Affidavit of Corporal Josh Richdale - document caviardé .....	III	913
R-32.5.: A Analysis of Data collected for M. Colapelle 2011-03-15 and 2011-03-16 .....	III	919
R-32.6: Affidavit of civilian member Jocelyn Fortin (MDI project Clemenza) .....	III	929
R-32.7: Note Colapelle .....	III	937
R-32.8: MDI technique targetting V. Mirarchi - September 21, 2011 .....	III	939
R-32.9: MDI technique targetting V. Mirarchi September 21, 2011 and December 19, 2011 .....	III	952
R-32.10: Excerpts V. Mirarchi Calendar, September 21, 2011 .....	III	970
R-32.11: Surveillance document V. Mirarchi September 21, 2011 .....	III	981
R-32.12: Lettre datée le 21 juin 2012 .....	III	995

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	VOLUME	PAGE
R-32.13: Agreed statement of facts on the chronology of disclosure for the purpose of motion R-32 .....	III	997

<b>VOLUME IV</b>
------------------

R-32.14: Notice of objection to disclosure of information s.37.1 CEA .....	IV	1006
R-32.15: Order for the appointment of an amicus curiae s 37 CEA .....	IV	1008
R-32.16: Notice of application for standing on s 37 of CEA application .....	IV	1014
R-34 : On motions R25, R-32 and R-32A Issues that necessitate a ruling from the Court .....	IV	1020
R-34.1: Defense precisions to R-34 .....	IV	1022
R v Mirarchi et al - Supp Submissions re MDI Disclosure.....	IV	1027
Factum of amicus Motions R-25 and R-32 .....	IV	1059
Outline for Crown's final arguments on R25 and R32.....	IV	1072
Motions R-25 and R-32 concerning the Investigative techniques privilege List of Items filed in ex parte sessions .....	IV	1079
EP-32.1.....	IV	1083
EP-32.2.....	IV	1085
EP-32.3.....	IV	1091
EP-32.4.....	IV	1096
EP-32.5.....	IV	1103
EP-32.6.....	IV	1114
EP-32.7.....	IV	1125
EP-32.8.....	IV	1131
EP-32.9.....	IV	1132
EP-32.10.....	IV	1134



## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	VOLUME	PAGE
EP-32.11 a) .....	IV	1140
EP-32.12.....	IV	1148
EP-32.13.....	IV	1168
EP-32.14.....	IV	1197
EP-32.15.....	IV	1209
EP-32.16.....	IV	1213
EP-32.17.....	IV	1215
EP-32.18.....	IV	1216
EP-32.19.....	IV	1217
EP-32.20.....	IV	1219
EP-32.21.....	IV	1221
EP-32.22.....	IV	1223
EP-32.23.....	IV	1224
EP-32.24.....	IV	1227
EP-32.25.....	IV	1230
EP-32.26.....	IV	1240
EP-32.27.....	IV	1252
EP-32.28.....	IV	1256
EP-32.29.....	IV	1258
EP-I-32.9 .....	IV	1272

<b>VOLUME V</b>
-----------------

DEPOSITIONS

Mark Flynn, November 11, 2014, transcript.....	V	1316
Mark Flynn, November 11,2014, ex parte transcript.....	V	1490
Mark Flynn, November 17, 2014, transcript.....	V	1517

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	VOLUME	PAGE
<b>VOLUME VI</b>		
Mark Flynn, November 27, 2014, transcript.....	VI	1763
Mark Flynn, December 1, 2014, Transcript.....	VI	1837
Reasons for redactions, December 2,2014, ex parte transcript.....	VI	2036
Mark Flynn, June 30, 2015, transcript.....	VI	2062
<b>VOLUME VII</b>		
Mark Flynn, June 30, 2015, ex parte transcript.....	VII	2204
Mark Flynn, July 2, 2015, ex parte transcript.....	VII	2265
Mark Flynn, July 14, 2015, ex parte transcript.....	VII	2419
Mark Flynn, July 16 , 2015, transcript.....	VII	2454
<b>VOLUME VIII</b>		
Josh Richdale, July 17 , 2015, transcript.....	VIII	2655
Josh Richdale, July 17, 2015, ex parte transcript .....	VIII	2770
Josh Richdale, July 20, 2015, ex parte transcript .....	VIII	2845
Jocelyn Fortin, July 21, 2015, transcript .....	VIII	2877
Jocelyn Fortin, July 21 , 2015, ex parte transcript .....	VIII	2923
Jocelyn Fortin, July 22, 2015, ex parte transcript .....	VIII	2985
<b>VOLUME IX</b>		
Jocelyn Fortin, July 23, 2015, ex parte transcript .....	IX	3096
Josh Richdale July 23, 2015, transcript .....	IX	3157
Josh Richdale, July 24, 2015, transcript .....	IX	3240
Crown's submissions, September 9, 2015, transcript.....	IX	3300

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	VOLUME	PAGE
<b>VOLUME X</b>		
Defense's submissions, September 11, 2015, transcript .....	X	3451
Crown's submissions, September, 17 2015 , ex parte transcript .....	X	3510
Crown and amicus curiae's submissions, September 18, 2015, ex parte transcript.....	X	3671
Common Law judgement, November 18, 2015, ex parte transcript.....	X	3842
<b>VOLUME XI</b>		
Exchange between the Court and the parties, November 23, 2015, transcript .....	XI	3384
Reasons for redactions, November 30, 2015, ex parte transcript.....	XI	3932
Reasons for redactions, December 1, 2015, ex parte transcript.....	XI	3963
Judgement on S.37 objection, December 4, 2015, ex parte transcript .....	XI	3981
S.37 evidence and exchange between the Court and the parties, November 27, 2015, transcript		
S.37 evidence and exchange between the Court and the parties, November 30, 2015, transcript		
 <b><u>ATTESTATION</u></b>		
Attestation of the appellant .....	XI	3986